



Opportunities And Challenges In The U.S. Multifamily Market

CHAPTER 20:

UNDERSTANDING RENT CONTROL AND ITS IMPACT ON SUPPLY: A COMPLEX ECONOMIC LANDSCAPE

DECEMBER 2, 2024 | JASON D. BEAKLEY, CERTIFIED GENERAL APPRAISER

Rent control, a policy implemented in various forms across many cities and states, remains one of the most contentious issues in urban economics and housing policy. While proponents argue that it provides essential protections for tenants, economists have long criticized rent control for its potential negative impacts on housing supply and overall market efficiency. This article delves into the complexities of rent control, examining its effects on housing supply and the broader implications for urban housing markets.

The Basics of Rent Control

Rent control typically involves government-imposed limits on the amount landlords can charge for rental properties. These policies can take various forms, from strict price ceilings to more moderate regulations that limit annual rent increases. The primary goal of rent control is to maintain affordable housing options, particularly in high-cost urban areas where rapid price appreciation can displace long-term residents.

The Economic Theory Behind Rent Control Criticism

The standard economic argument against rent control is rooted in basic supply and demand principles. According to this view, artificially suppressing rents below market rates leads to several negative outcomes:

1. **Reduced Supply:** When rents are capped below market rates, property owners have less

incentive to maintain existing rental units or invest in new ones. This can lead to a decrease in the overall supply of rental housing.

2. **Misallocation of Resources:** Rent control can create inefficiencies in the housing market. For example, tenants in rent-controlled units may stay in apartments that no longer suit their needs (e.g., empty-nesters in large family apartments) because the artificially low rent makes moving economically unattractive.
3. **Reduced Mobility:** Tenants in rent-controlled units are less likely to move, even when job opportunities or life changes might otherwise prompt relocation. This “lock-in” effect can have broader economic implications, reducing labor market flexibility.
4. **Deterioration of Housing Stock:** With limited ability to raise rents, landlords may reduce spending on maintenance and improvements, leading to a gradual decline in housing quality.

Empirical Evidence on Rent Control's Impact

While the theoretical arguments against rent control are well-established, empirical research has provided a more nuanced picture of its effects:

1. **San Francisco Study:** A influential study by Diamond, McQuade, and Qian (2019) examined the expansion of rent control in San Francisco in 1994. They found that rent control:
 - Reduced tenant displacement, particularly among older and long-term residents.
 - Led to a 15% reduction in rental housing supply as landlords converted rental

properties to condos or redeveloped buildings to avoid rent control regulations.

- Caused a 5.1% city-wide rent increase due to the reduced supply.
2. **Cambridge, Massachusetts:** Research by Autor, Palmer, and Pathak (2014) on the end of rent control in Cambridge found that decontrol led to significant property value increases, not only for previously controlled units but also for nearby never-controlled properties. This suggests that rent control had depressed property values and investment in affected neighborhoods.
 3. **New Jersey Study:** Contrary to some expectations, a study of rent control in New Jersey found that it actually increased housing supply over three decades, though this was largely attributed to landlords subdividing larger units into smaller ones.

The Debate Over Long-Term Effects

While short-term benefits of rent control for existing tenants are often clear, the long-term effects on housing supply and affordability are more contentious:

1. **Supply Constraints:** Critics argue that rent control discourages new construction and investment in rental housing. The National Multifamily Housing Council cites economist Assar Lindbeck's statement that “rent control appears to be the most efficient technique presently known to destroy a city—except for bombing.”
2. **Maintenance and Quality:** There's evidence that

rent-controlled properties receive less maintenance and improvement, potentially leading to a deterioration of housing stock over time.

3. **Market Distortions:** Rent control can create a two-tiered rental market, with protected tenants benefiting from below-market rents while newcomers face higher prices in the uncontrolled sector.
4. **Gentrification Paradox:** Some research suggests that rent control can actually fuel gentrification by incentivizing landlords to convert rental units to condos or other forms of housing not subject to control.

Alternative Approaches and Policy Considerations

Given the potential drawbacks of traditional rent control, policymakers and economists have proposed alternative approaches to address housing affordability:

1. **Targeted Subsidies:** Direct financial assistance to low-income renters, such as housing vouchers, can help maintain affordability without distorting the broader market.
2. **Inclusionary Zoning:** Requiring developers to include a percentage of affordable units in new developments can increase the supply of affordable housing without imposing blanket rent controls.
3. **Supply-Side Solutions:** Many economists argue that the most effective long-term solution to housing affordability is to increase overall supply through zoning reforms and incentives for new construction.
4. **Moderate Forms of Rent Stabilization:** Some cities have implemented more flexible forms of rent regulation that allow for reasonable increases and exemptions for new construction, aiming to balance tenant protections with market incentives.

Conclusion: A Nuanced Approach to Housing Policy

The debate over rent control highlights the complex challenges of balancing short-term affordability with long-term housing market health. While rent control

can provide immediate relief to existing tenants, its potential negative impacts on housing supply and quality cannot be ignored.

As cities continue to grapple with housing affordability crises, policymakers must consider a holistic approach that addresses both immediate needs and long-term market dynamics. This may involve combining targeted tenant protections with policies that encourage new construction and investment in housing.

Ultimately, the goal should be to create a housing market that provides affordable options for all residents while maintaining the economic incentives necessary for a healthy, growing housing supply. Achieving this balance will require ongoing research, policy innovation, and a willingness to adapt strategies based on empirical evidence rather than ideological positions.

Citations:

- [1]<https://www.nmhc.org/news/articles/the-high-cost-of-rent-control/>
- [2]https://www.nber.org/system/files/working_papers/w24181/w24181.pdf
- [3]<https://www.brookings.edu/articles/what-does-economic-evidence-tell-us-about-the-effects-of-rent-control/>
- [4]<https://prospect.org/infrastructure/housing/2023-05-16-economists-hate-rent-control/>
- [5]<https://www.stlouisfed.org/on-the-economy/2024/feb/what-are-long-run-trade-offs-rent-control-policies>
- [6] <https://www.econlib.org/library/Enc/RentControl.html>
- [7]https://www.reddit.com/r/AskEconomics/comments/1991kmh/why_do_economists_oppose_rent_controls_even_in/
- [8]<https://www.pacificresearch.org/increasing-rent-control-will-decrease-needed-housing-supply>



Jeason D. Beakley

CERTIFIED GENERAL APPRAISER

Director

+1-480-440-2842 Ext. 09

jbeakley@fourcv.com

www.fourcv.com



FOUR CORNERS VALUATIONS
REAL ESTATE ADVISORY SERVICES

Four Corners Valuations delivers exceptional valuation and advisory services across the US and globally, offering a unique blend of local expertise and international experience. Utilizing advanced technology and superior data sources, we ensure accurate and comprehensive valuations for developers, investors, lenders, and other stakeholders. With licensed professionals across the United States and experienced in more than 60 countries, we are dedicated to excellence and committed to guiding our clients towards informed and successful decisions.

OFFICE LOCATIONS

USA

Chicago - Dallas - Houston - Phoenix
Tucson - Washington, DC

INTERNATIONAL

Argentina - Barbados - Brazil - Chile - Ecuador
Guatemala - India - Israel - Mexico - Morocco
Panama - Paraguay - Peru - Philippines
Puerto Rico - Spain - UAE

VALUATIONS • MARKET / FEASIBILITY STUDIES
LITIGATION SUPPORT • CONSULTING
ESTATES • BANKRUPTCY • PROBATE • DIVORCE • DAMAGED PROPERTY
PARTNERSHIP SOLUTION • MINORITY INTEREST ESTIMATES

+1.480.440.2842 www.fourcv.com